Quaternary Science Reviews 77 (2013) 190-209

Contents lists available at SciVerse ScienceDirect

## **Quaternary Science Reviews**

journal homepage: www.elsevier.com/locate/quascirev

## Formation of mega-scale glacial lineations on the Dubawnt Lake Ice Stream bed: 1. size, shape and spacing from a large remote sensing dataset

C.R. Stokes <sup>a,\*</sup>, M. Spagnolo<sup>b</sup>, C.D. Clark<sup>c</sup>, C. Ó Cofaigh<sup>a</sup>, O.B. Lian<sup>d</sup>, R.B. Dunstone<sup>a</sup>

<sup>a</sup> Department of Geography, Durham University, Durham DH1 3LE, UK

<sup>b</sup> School of Geosciences, University of Aberdeen, UK

<sup>c</sup> Department of Geography, University of Sheffield, UK

<sup>d</sup> Department of Geography, University of the Fraser Valley, Abbotsford, B.C., Canada

#### ARTICLE INFO

Article history: Received 22 January 2013 Received in revised form 20 May 2013 Accepted 3 June 2013 Available online 6 July 2013

*Keywords:* Mega-scale glacial lineations Subglacial bedforms Ice stream

## ABSTRACT

Mega-scale glacial lineations (MSGLs) are the largest flow parallel bedforms produced by ice sheets and are formed beneath rapidly-flowing ice streams. Knowledge of their characteristics and genesis is likely to result in an improved understanding of the rate at which ice and sediment are discharged by ice sheets, but there is little consensus as to how they are formed and there are few quantitative datasets of their characteristics with which to formulate or test hypotheses. This paper presents the results of a remote sensing survey of  $\sim$  46,000 bedforms on the Dubawnt Lake palaeo-ice stream bed, focussing on a central transect of 17,038 that includes highly elongate bedforms previously described as MSGLs. Within this transect, lineations exceed 10 km in length (max. >20 km) and 23% have elongation ratios >10:1 (max. 149:1). Highly elongate features are interspersed with much shorter drumlin-like features, but longer bedforms are typically narrower, suggesting that their length develops more quickly than, or at the expense of, their width. Bedforms are broadly symmetrical in plan-form and have a preferred lateral spacing of 50–250 m, which implies a regular, rather than random, pattern of corrugations. Comparison with drumlins reveals that the more attenuated MSGLs simply extend the 'tail' of the distribution of data, rather than plotting as a separate population. Taken together, this supports the idea of a subglacial bedform continuum primarily controlled by ice velocity, but existing hypotheses of MSGL formation are either not supported, or are insufficiently developed to explain our observations. Rather, we conclude that, under conditions of rapid ice flow, MSGLs attain their great length relatively quickly (decades) through a probable combination of subglacial deformation, which attenuates ridges, and erosional processes that removes material from between them.

© 2013 Elsevier Ltd. All rights reserved.

## 1. Introduction

Mega-scale glacial lineations (MSGLs) are highly elongate ridges of sediment produced subglacially (Clark, 1993). They are similar to other flow parallel bedforms (e.g. flutes and drumlins) but are typically much longer (~10–100 km), wider (ca 200–1300 m); and have lateral wavelengths (spacing) of 0.2–5 km and amplitudes from just a few metres to several 10s of metres (Clark, 1993; Clark et al., 2003). Although observations of large and highly elongate glacial bedforms have been noted for several decades (e.g. Tyrrell, 1906; Dean, 1953; Lemke, 1958), they were not formally recognised and named until

\* Corresponding author.

E-mail address: c.r.stokes@durham.ac.uk (C.R. Stokes).

the early 1990s (see Clark, 1993), following the advent of satellite imagery that enabled a large-scale view of palaeo-ice sheet beds. Although they are commonly identified and mapped as ridges, some workers have taken the view that, collectively, their appearance is more akin to a grooved or corrugated till surface (e.g. Dean, 1953; Lemke, 1958; Heidenreich, 1964; Clark et al., 2003; Stokes and Clark, 2003a). In this paper, we refer to MSGL in their broadest sense and include features that are variously described as 'bundle structures' (Canals et al., 2000), 'mega-flutings' (e.g. Shaw et al., 2000), 'megalineations' (Shaw et al., 2008), and 'megagrooves' (Bradwell et al., 2008), all of which fit the characteristics of MSGL described in Clark (1993).

Determining the origin of MSGLs represents a key scientific challenge and various hypotheses have been put forward and include subglacial sediment deformation (Clark, 1993), catastrophic







<sup>0277-3791/\$ —</sup> see front matter @ 2013 Elsevier Ltd. All rights reserved. http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.quascirev.2013.06.003

meltwater floods (Shaw et al., 2000, 2008), groove-ploughing (Clark et al., 2003), spiral flows in basal ice (Schoof and Clarke, 2008), and a rilling instability in subglacial meltwater flow (Fowler, 2010). Although there is little agreement about the genesis of MSGLs, a key aspect of their formation is their association with areas of rapidlyflowing ice (King et al., 2009). Clark (1993) was the first to suggest that their great length might be related to rapid ice flow and later work has confirmed the notion that bedform attenuation is related to ice velocity (cf. Hart, 1999; Ó Cofaigh et al., 2002; Stokes and Clark, 2002; Briner, 2007). Indeed, the presence of MSGLs has been used to infer the location of numerous palaeo-ice streams (cf. Stokes and Clark, 1999; Canals et al., 2000; Ó Cofaigh et al., 2002, 2010; Stokes and Clark, 2003a, b; Graham et al., 2009; Livingstone et al., 2012) including immediately down-ice from existing ice streams (cf. Shipp et al., 1999; Wellner et al., 2006) and, most recently, beneath active ice streams (cf. King et al., 2009; Jezek et al., 2011).

Given the importance of ice streams to ice sheet mass balance and concerns over their recent and future dynamics (e.g. Pritchard et al., 2009), it is becoming increasingly important to understand the subglacial processes that facilitate their flow and govern the rate at which both ice and sediment are discharged by ice sheets. Moreover, because we now know that MSGL are one manifestation of these processes, a better understanding of the mechanism by which they form is likely to result in a major advance in our knowledge of the basal processes that act to sustain or inhibit ice stream flow. To date, however, most accounts of MSGLs are restricted to qualitative descriptions of their characteristics and. compared to drumlins (e.g. Clark et al., 2009; Hess and Briner, 2009: Spagnolo et al., 2010, 2011, 2012: Stokes et al., 2011), there are few systematic measurement of their dimensions and morphometry based on large sample sizes (e.g. Graham et al., 2009) and few observations of their sedimentology and stratigraphy (e.g. Lemke, 1958; Shaw et al., 2000).

To address these issues, we have undertaken a multi-scaled mapping and field campaign to characterise the size, shape, spacing, and composition of MSGLs on the bed of the previously identified Dubawnt Lake palaeo-ice stream (Stokes and Clark, 2003b), which operated in a part of the Laurentide Ice Sheet (LIS). This ice stream was selected because it contains tens of thousands of bedforms and represents a pristine landscape formed by a late and relatively brief episode of ice streaming, with very limited overprinting by younger events (Stokes and Clark, 2003b). Our results are reported in two papers that focus on: (1) their morphometry and pattern from remote sensing (Paper 1), and (2), their sedimentology and stratigraphy from sediment exposures (Paper 2: Ó Cofaigh et al., 2013). The aim of this paper is to provide a substantive dataset (several thousand bedforms) on the size, shape and pattern of MSGLs. Our focus is on reporting a statistically robust population to ascertain their key characteristics (cf. Clark et al., 2009) and assess the implications for their formation. For example, what is their typical size and shape, how are they grouped, and how might this be related to ideas of their formation? To what extent might they be related to drumlins, e.g. do they form part of a glacier bedform continuum (Rose, 1987) or are they, in this sense, discrete landforms?

#### 2. Previous work on the Dubawnt Lake palaeo-ice stream

The Dubawnt Lake Ice Stream (DLIS) bed is located on the northwestern Canadian Shield and spans the border between Nunavut and Northwest territories, see Fig. 1. Tyrrell (1906) was the first to describe the 'drumlinoid' ridges that characterise the region known as the Barren Grounds and early work in this area noted the highly elongate glacial lineations north-west of Dubawnt Lake (e.g. Bird, 1953; Craig, 1964), which Dean (1953: p. 21) described as having a "longitudinal axis 15–30 times the length of the transverse axis". More recently, Aylsworth and Shilts (1989a) speculated about the possible role of rapid ice flow in creating the spectacular flutings and the distinctive 'bottle-neck' flow pattern that is clearly identifiable on the Glacial Map of Canada (Prest et al., 1968). This distinct



**Fig. 1.** Location of the Dubawnt Lake palaeo-ice stream within the region of the former North American Laurentide Ice Sheet. Margin position and proglacial lake extent at 8.5 <sup>14</sup>C yr BP (9.5 cal ka BP) are taken from Dyke et al. (2003), which is just prior to the initiation of streaming flow. As the western margin retreated to the south–east, proglacial lakes formed over the Canadian Shield and are thought to have triggered a short-lived episode of streaming (few hundred years) that had ceased by 8.2 <sup>14</sup>C yr BP (cf. Stokes and Clark, 2003b; Stokes and Clark, 2004).

bedform pattern was also mapped by Boulton and Clark (1990), who attributed its formation to a late glacial event in their reconstruction of the LIS. This interpretation was later supported by Kleman and Borgström (1996), who used the Dubawnt Lake flow-set as an exemplar of a 'surge fan' in their glacial inversion model for reconstructing palaeo-ice sheets. Surge fans are thought to form during the decay stages of an ice sheet, often in relation to proglacial lake basins, and lineations are thought to form nearly synchronously over the whole fan area (Kleman and Borgström, 1996).

Building on this work, Stokes and Clark (2003b) used remote sensing techniques to undertake a detailed analysis of the ice stream bed and confirmed that the flow-set was formed by a palaeo-ice stream that operated for a few hundred years during deglaciation, just prior to 8.2 <sup>14</sup>C ka BP. Stokes and Clark (2003c) highlighted the unusual location of the ice stream on the relatively hard bedrock of the Canadian Shield, although parts of the ice stream are underlain by softer sedimentary rocks, including the extensive sandstones of the Thelon sedimentary basin, which underlies the most elongate bedforms. The ice stream is thought to have been triggered by the development of a proglacial lake which induced high calving rates and drawdown of ice from points further inland (Stokes and Clark, 2004). Indeed, ice stream activity and the associated thinning of the ice sheet was probably responsible for the final south-eastward migration of the Keewatin Ice Divide and the subsequent deglaciation of the area (McMartin and Henderson, 2004). It has also been noted that parts of the ice stream bed ( $\sim 7\%$ ) are characterised by ribbed moraines that are superimposed on the elongate bedforms produced by the ice stream (e.g. Avlsworth and Shilts, 1989a; Stokes et al., 2006). Stokes et al. (2008) suggested that these ribbed moraines were generated during ice stream shutdown when the till stiffened as a result of dewatering and/or basal freeze-on (cf. Christoffersen and Tulaczyk, 2003). Apart from the ribbed moraines, no other (younger) ice flow events are superimposed on the flow-set and, because it represents a coherent bedform pattern with individual lineations displaying exceptional parallel conformity to neighbouring bedforms, it can be assumed that they are all related to the flow and final stoppage of the ice stream (cf. Stokes and Clark, 2003b, 2008).

In terms of its dimensions, the ice stream is reconstructed at  $\sim$  450 km in length and it depicts a broad zone of flow convergence into a narrower main 'trunk' (~140 km wide), which then diverges towards a lobate terminus (cf. Stokes and Clark, 2003b) (Fig. 1). Mapping of selected along-flow transects of glacial lineations revealed that their elongation ratio matches the expected pattern of ice velocity across the flow-set (Stokes and Clark, 2002, 2003b). The longest lineations (>10 km in length) occur in the main 'trunk' of the ice stream where elongation ratios have been reported to approach 50:1 (Stokes and Clark, 2003b), clearly placing them in the category of MSGLs (cf. Clark, 1993).

## 3. Methods

## 3.1. Data sources and mapping

We compiled complete coverage of the ice stream bed (and surroundings) with cloud-free scenes from the Landsat Enhanced Thematic Mapper Plus satellite, downloaded from the Global Land Cover Facility (http://glcf.umiacs.umd.edu/). This imagery is orthorectified with a multispectral spatial resolution of 30 m (bands 1–5, 7; band 6 = 60 m), 15 m in panchromatic (band 8). This resolution has been shown to be more than sufficient for the mapping of large-scale glacial geomorphology, e.g. drumlins, ribbed moraines, major terminal moraines, etc. (cf. Clark, 1997). In addition, we also acquired around 300 panchromatic aerial photographs (hard copy) from the Canadian National Air Photo library in Ottawa.

Previous work mapped 8856 lineations from transects along the southern half of the ice stream bed (Stokes and Clark, 2002, 2003a,b,c). We use these data and supplement them with new mapping of every lineation on the entire ice stream bed (flowset), irrespective of its location or dimensions, i.e. we used no preconceived definition of MSGLs to select the ones that we would map. Given that the flow-set contains tens of thousands of bedforms, each lineation was simply depicted with a single line along the ridge crest. These data provide a simple measure of bedform length and location, which is useful for calculating derivatives such as wavelengths (spacing), density, pattern and orientation. However, our specific aim was to collate a large sample of data that also included the width and shape of MSGLs that are known to exist in the narrowest part of the flow-set (cf. Stokes and Clark, 2002, 2003b). This was achieved by mapping a broad transect of lineations from the central trunk of the ice stream (where the longest bedforms occur) and digitising around their break-of-slope as polygon features (e.g. Clark et al., 2009). Fig. 2 shows the coverage of satellite imagery, the extent of the ice stream flow-set (mapped as lines), and the extent of the DLIS transect mapped as polygons, along with examples of some mapped lineations.

Mapping using satellite imagery was cross-checked using aerial photographs taken of specific regions (e.g. Stokes et al., 2006) and ground-truthing was undertaken for specific areas during field-work in the summers of 2004, 2005 and 2006. Ideally, we would have liked to have obtained data on lineation height (e.g. Spagnolo et al., 2012) but, given the low amplitude of most of the features ( $\sim$ 5 m), this would have required elevation data (e.g. a Digital Elevation Model) with a spatial resolution of just a few metres, which is not presently available for this region.

## 3.2. Measurement of lineation size

For lineations mapped as a single line (from hereon referred to as the 'ice stream flowset' database), we used a Geographical Information System (GIS: ArcMap) to extract the length (L) and location (mid-point (M) of each line). For the zone of more elongate bedforms across the central transect of the ice stream flowset mapped as a polygons (from hereon referred to as the 'DLIS transect'), the area (A) is extracted from the GIS and, following Spagnolo et al. (2010), the length (L) was derived from a tool that plots the longest straight line within the mapped polygon, see Fig. 3a, and this also gives orientation and defines the location of the upstream (U) and down-stream (D) limits of the bedform (i.e. the start point and end point of L). The width (W) is then derived from another tool that extracts the longest straight line perpendicular to L (Fig. 3a), which also gives the intersect (I). The elongation ratio (ER) is simply the ratio of L:W.

## 3.3. Measurement of lineation shape

Using the parameters described above, Spagnolo et al. (2010) developed simple methods to explore the planar (plan-form) shape of drumlins in order to test the long-standing idea that they are asymmetric (i.e. larger, blunter upstream and thinner, tapering downstream: e.g. Chorley, 1959). Although there are different ways of quantifying the plan-form, we use a method from Spagnolo et al. (2010) that divides the shape of the bedform into an upstream and downstream half. Each polygon is split in half by a line perpendicular to its length (*L*) and passing through midpoint (*M*) of *L*. In this way, drumlin planar asymmetry  $As_{pl}$  a is described as:

$$As_{pl_a} = (A_{up}/A)$$



**Fig. 2.** (A) Extent of the Dubawnt Lake ice stream flow-set is shown in red (from Kleman and Borgström, 1996; Stokes and Clark, 2003b) and coverage of Landsat satellite imagery is shown in light grey boxes. Every lineation within the Dubawnt lake flow-set (red outline) was mapped as a line and a central transect of these lineations was mapped as polygons (dark grey box: DLIS transect). An example of the Landsat imagery (path 039, row 015) is shown in (B), alongside mapped polygons in (C); location shown by yellow box in (A). (For interpretation of the references to colour in this figure legend, the reader is referred to the web version of this article.)

Where  $A_{up} =$  upstream area, and A = total area (Fig. 3b–d). Higher values indicate upstream halves that are larger than downstream halves (i.e. classically asymmetric: Fig. 3b) and lower values indicate downstream halves that are larger than upstream halves (i.e. reversed asymmetry: Fig. 3d).

## 3.4. Measurement of lineation density and 'packing'

We make distinctions between point density (simply the number of bedforms per unit area), linear density (the cumulative length of lineation per unit area), and areal density (or 'packing': the cumulative area of lineations per unit area). Thus, point density is simply extracted from the number of lineations, as recorded by a point location (*M*, above) per unit area (and can be extracted from both the entire flow-set and the DLIS transect); linear density is extracted from the cumulative length of lineations per unit area (e.g. from the entire flow-set); whereas packing is extracted from the cumulative surface area of lineations, per unit area (which can only be extracted from DLIS transect mapped as polygons).

## 3.5. Measurement of lineation spacing

In addition to their density or packing, we also quantify bedform spacing and pattern, which has only been measured in a handful of



**Fig. 3.** Illustration of the different parameters extracted from the GIS database of lineations mapped as polygons in (a): A = area; L = length; W = width; U = upstream limit; I = intersection of L and W; M = mid-point of L; D = downstream limit. To measure the planar symmetry, the shape of the bedform was divided into an upstream and downstream half and calculated as:  $As_{pLa} = (A_{up}/A)$ , where  $A_{up} = \text{upstream}$  area. Higher values indicate upstream halves that are larger than downstream halves (i.e. classically asymmetric (b)) and lower values indicate downstream halves that are larger than upstream halves (i.e. reversed asymmetry (d)). A perfectly symmetric case ( $As_{pLa} = 0.5$ ) is shown in (c).

studies (e.g. Smalley and Unwin, 1968). Nearest neighbour analysis of drumlin fields has been shown to be fraught with methodological deficiencies associated with sampling areas (cf. Clark, 2010) and has led to contradictory results (e.g. Smalley and Unwin, 1968; Baranowksi, 1977; Boots and Burns, 1984). In this paper, we simplify quantification of bedform spacing to two measurements. The first calculates the distance to the nearest lineation in the along-flow direction (longitudinal spacing) and the second calculates the distance to the nearest lineation in the across-flow direction (transverse/lateral spacing). Although flow-lines within the flow-set are curvilinear, these distances can be approximated as straight lines because bedforms are packed closely together.

The longitudinal spacing of the mapped lineaments was evaluated using a specific GIS technique based on three fundamental steps (Spagnolo et al., in prep). Firstly, the direction of ice flow is derived relative to each individual bedform as the average azimuth of the 10 closest bedforms. The 10 nearest bedforms are identified using the MSGL mid-points (M: see Fig. 3) and using a specific GIS application called 'distance between points' in Hawth's Analysis Tools, which is an extension for ESRI's ArcGIS. Second, the closest along-flow bedform is identified. Given the average azimuth, the longitudinal distances between each individual MSGL and its 10 neighbours can be evaluated geometrically (by applying the Pythagorean theorem). The shortest distance is used to identify the closest longitudinal neighbour. A filter is also applied to guarantee that the identified closest bedform is aligned with the original bedform. This is done by analysing the across-flow distance between an MSGL midpoint and its closest bedform's midpoint, and by verifying that this does not exceed half the original MSGL width. Third, the real distance ('gap') between each nearest bedform pair is evaluated by subtracting the half-lengths of the two bedforms from the absolute distance between their midpoints. The transverse spacing technique follows exactly the same steps, the only difference being that the shadow is projected transverse (perpendicular) to the ice flow direction and that the gap distance is obtained by subtracting the half-widths of the two bedforms from the absolute distance between their mid-points.

## 4. Results

#### 4.1. Lineation length and distribution from the ice stream flow-set

Mapping of the entire ice stream flow-set reveals a total of 42,583 lineations, with each bedform depicted by a single line along its ridge crest, parallel to ice flow. The mean length of bedforms across the entire ice stream flow-set is 879 m (median length = 667 m) and Fig. 4A shows their distribution, with each line feature coloured according to its length. As noted in previous work based on more limited mapping (e.g. Stokes and Clark, 2002, 2003b), there is a clear pattern, with the most elongate bedforms occurring in the central, narrower, trunk of the ice stream tract, where velocities are assumed to have been highest. In this zone, lineations commonly exceed 5 km in length and this region is the focus of our more detailed mapping of the features as polygons, where we have mapped a total of 17,038 lineations across a broad transect in the central trunk (see Fig. 2). Fig. 4B and C show a sample of the mapping of this region, which illustrates numerous bedforms between 5 and  $\sim$  20 km in length and elongation ratios commonly in excess of 30:1. Fig. 5 shows examples of these distinctive bedforms as they appear on satellite imagery and oblique aerial photography.

Histograms of lineation length from both the entire ice stream flow-set and the DLIS transect are shown in Fig. 6. Both populations show unimodal distributions with a strong positive skew (very long tail) and whilst it is clear that the DLIS transect is a sub-sample of more elongate bedforms (MSGLs), it should be noted that shorter lineations also occur within this region, such that the populations clearly overlap. This is also apparent as small-scale heterogeneity within the general patterns seen in Fig. 4.

Our results now focus on the DLIS transect as a means of characterising the size and shape of the most elongate bedforms. Note that we choose to measure the size and shape of all of the lineations in the DLIS transect (including smaller features that might be better described as drumlins), rather than selecting a sub-sample of lineations above a certain size to characterise the field of MSGLs. Our justification for this is threefold: (i), there is no strict definition or physical basis to differentiate and select MSGLs from shorter bedforms and so any threshold (e.g. an elongation ratio >10:1, cf. Stokes and Clark, 1999) would be somewhat arbitrary and difficult to justify; (ii), the use of any threshold to distinguish MSGLs would introduce circular arguments, i.e. we select a sub-population of elongate bedforms and then use these to show that they are more elongate than other bedforms; and (iii), the MSGLs in this particular flow-set are clearly associated with less elongate bedforms (e.g. Fig. 4) and, given that we know it represents a single, short-lived episode of ice stream flow (Stokes and Clark, 2003b), we regard this as an important observation for constraining theories of their formation.

# 4.2. Length, width and elongation ratio of bedforms from the DLIS transect

Histograms of length, width and elongation ratio of the lineations from the DLIS transect are shown in Fig. 7. The mean length is



**Fig. 4.** (A) Glacial lineations on the DLIS bed shaded according to their length (n = 42,583). Note the shorter lineations in the onset zone and, especially, towards the terminus, with the longest lineations in the narrower main trunk. This area was selected for more detailed mapping of the lineations as polygons (black rectangle) and an extract of this mapped area is shown shaded according to both length (B) and elongation ratio (C).

945 m (min. = 186 m; max. = 20,146 m) and the mean width is  $\sim$  117 m (min. = 39; max. = 533), see Table 1. Elongation ratios are particularly striking, with a mean of 8.7 (min. = 2.2) and with 23% in excess of 10:1. The maximum is 149:1 which is, to our knowledge, the highest ever reported in the literature. All distributions are unimodal with a strong positive skew, as has been observed for a large population of drumlins (cf. Clark et al., 2009).

Relationships between length, width and elongation ratio (cf. Clark et al., 2009) are plotted in Fig. 8. A plot of length versus width (Fig. 8a) reveals only a weak tendency for longer bedforms to be wider. A power law function gives a higher  $r^2$  (0.53) than a simple linear relationship ( $r^2 = 0.24$ ), although neither fit particularly well. Indeed, the very longest bedforms (e.g. >10 km) tend to be narrower and the widest bedforms tend to be <5 km long. Unsurprisingly, bedform length and elongation ratio (Fig. 8b) are strongly correlated because elongation ratio is derived from length. Linear and power law functions give similar  $r^2$  values (~0.70), but the fact that these

correlations are not even higher indicates that bedforms of a certain length can exhibit a range of elongation ratios, e.g. lineations 5 km long exhibit elongation ratios from <10:1 to >60:1. Shorter bedforms (e.g. <5 km) have a lower range of elongation ratios, as seen in the tighter clustering of points towards the origin of the scatterplot. The correlation between width and elongation ratio reveals weak correlations, with neither a linear ( $r^2 = 0.12$ ) or power law function ( $r^2 = 0.19$ ) providing a good description of the data. However, the plot clearly shows that bedforms with the highest elongation ratios (e.g. >40:1) tend to be narrower. No bedform with a width >400 m, for example, attains an elongation ratio >20:1.

## 4.3. Planar shape of bedforms from the DLIS transect

Measurements of the planar shape  $(As_{pl_a})$  of bedforms within the DLIS transect are plotted as a histogram in Fig. 9. The mean and median value for bedforms in the DLIS transect is 0.52, which



Fig. 5. Landsat imagery (path 039, row 015) of highly elongate MSGL in the central trunk of the ice stream (A) and oblique aerial photographs of parts of the image in (B) and (C) (photographs: C. R. Stokes).



**Fig. 6.** Histograms of lineation length from the line database and the polygon database. Note that both populations show unimodal distributions with a strong positive skew. Although the polygon database clearly contains longer MSGL, this area of the ice stream bed also contains smaller lineations. Bin size is 100 m.

indicates a very slight tendency towards classical asymmetry (modal class in Fig. 9 is 0.50-0.52 and 19% of bedforms fall within this class: Table 1). The data are tightly clustered (5th percentile = 0.45; 95th percentile is 0.59) but there are extreme cases of bedforms that are clearly asymmetric in the classic sense (max = 0.73) and in the reverse sense (min = 0.31), i.e. with downstream halves much larger than their upstream halves.

Fig. 10 plots the planar shape across the entire transect and indicates that there are no obvious clusters where large numbers of bedforms (n > 10) exhibit a preferred preference for classic or reverse asymmetry. However, there are some places where small groups of bedforms ( $\sim 5-10$ ) that are classically asymmetric sit alongside each other (Fig. 10b). There are no similar patches for those that show reverse asymmetry.

## 4.4. Patterning and spacing of MSGL

The density of lineations across the entire flow-set is shown in Fig. 11 as both number of lineations per unit area (Fig. 11A) and cumulative length of lineations per unit area (Fig. 11B). Although



197

**Fig. 7.** Histograms and summary statistics of the DLIS transect for length (A), width (B), and elongation ratio (C). Bin sizes are 100 m, 10 m and 1, respectively. Box-and-whisker plots show the 25 and 75th percentiles (grey box), the 10th and 90<sup>th</sup> percentiles (whisker ends) and the 5th and 95th percentiles (black dots). The mean (horizontal line) and median (dashed horizontal line) are also shown.

there is considerable heterogeneity, both plots reveal high densities of lineations towards the terminus of the ice stream flow-set, where numerous smaller bedforms occur (cf. Fig. 4). However, when the cumulative length of the bedforms is included (Fig. 11B), regions of the central narrower trunk emerge as dense areas of bedforms.

Similar heterogeneity is seen in the data from just the DLIS transect, shown in Fig. 12. There are clear regions where the

#### Table 1

Summary statistics of lineation characteristics from the DLIS transect (see Fig. 2 for location).

Statistic	Length (m)	Width (m)	Elongation ratio	Planar asymmetry ( <i>As<sub>pl_a</sub></i> )	Distance to lateral nearest neighbour (m) <sup>b</sup>	Distance to longitudinal nearest neighbour (m)
n	17,038	17,038	17,038	17,016 <sup>a</sup>	11,810	7,731 <sup>b</sup>
Minimum	186	39	2.2	0.31	0	0.05
5 <sup>th</sup> percentile	334	61	4.1	0.45	9	40
25 <sup>th</sup> percentile	506	79	6	0.49	37	173
Modal class	500-600 (13%)	80-90 (15%)	5-6 (16%)	0.50-0.52 (19%)	0-50 (34%)	50-100 (8%)
Mean	945	117	8.7	0.52	234	625
Median	712	96	7.2	0.52	84	430
75 <sup>th</sup> percentile	1084	122	10	0.55	245	874
95 <sup>th</sup> percentile	2248	195	17.6	0.59	978	1829
Maximum	20,146	553	149	0.73	5104	8285
St. deviation	866	45	6	0.04	411	637

<sup>a</sup> The population (n) for these calculations is less than the total population (17,038) because some thin bedforms displayed a slight curvature which meant that the midpoint used as part of the automated calculations lay outside the polygon. As such, they were excluded.

<sup>b</sup> The population (n) for these calculations is less than the total population (17,038) because some polygons did not have an obvious nearest neighbour and because reciprocal nearest neighbours were excluded.



**Fig. 8.** Relationships between bedform length versus width (a), length versus elongation ratio (b) and elongation ratio versus width (c) for the DLIS transect data (n = 17,038). Black lines represent linear fits to the data clouds whereas red gives a power law function. Exponential fits gave very low  $r^2$  values (<0.15) for all plots and, for clarity, are not shown.

number of lineations exceeds 5 per km<sup>2</sup> but intervening patches show much lower densities. The additional measurement of 'packing' (cumulative area per km<sup>2</sup> Fig. 12B) indicates that, in the DLIS transect, higher densities of bedforms are likely to be composed of those that are packed together quite closely (note some correspondence between high density areas in Fig. 12A and B), but not always.

The spacing of MSGLs is shown in Fig. 13 in terms of the distance to the nearest neighbour both across flow (lateral) and along-flow (longitudinal) direction. Similar to histograms of their size and elongation (e.g. Fig. 7), the distributions of the data are unimodal with a strong positive skew. This suggests that the MSGL have preferred lateral spacing (Fig. 13A) of between 50 and 250 m (mean = 233; median = 84 m: Table 1). The data for longitudinal spacing (Fig. 13B) is less 'peaky' but is, again, clearly unimodal, with most bedforms between 200 and 850 m apart (mean of 624 m, median of 429 m). A more random distribution might be expected to fill the bins on the *x*-axis more evenly, e.g. all bins <500 m.

# 5. Discussion: implications for the formation of MSGL and subglacial bedforms

5.1. Size and shape characteristics of MSGL and comparison with drumlins

Comprehensive mapping of the DLIS bed reveals that this flowset contains some of the longest subglacial bedforms observed above present-day sea level. These bedforms are found in the narrower 'trunk' of the bottleneck flow pattern and reach lengths >20 km and elongation ratios that approach 150:1. Widths range from 39 to 553 m (mean 117 m) and lateral spacing range from 0 to 978 m (mean 233). These data fit broad descriptions of MSGL (e.g. Clark, 1993; Clark et al., 2003; Ó Cofaigh et al., 2005; Livingstone et al., 2012), whose scale Clark (1993) suggested "renders them distinct from other ice-moulded landforms" (p. 27). However, he acknowledged that his assertion of the spatial frequency of bedforms, reproduced in Fig. 14A, was based on little quantitative data.

Our large dataset allows us to explore the spatial characteristics of MSGL and test the hypothesis that, in this location at least, they are a distinct bedform. In doing so, we suggest that there are several lines of evidence that falsify this hypothesis. Firstly, and most obviously, is that the MSGL-like features are found within a large flow-set that depicts a general pattern of less elongate bedforms immediately upstream and downstream of the longer bedforms (Fig. 4A). The high levels of parallel conformity (Fig. 5) and the lack of cross-cutting bedforms suggest that we are not viewing a mixed population of bedforms created by more than one ice flow event (i.e. one slow and one fast flow event). Second, within this broad pattern, there are clear cases of MSGL-like features sitting side by side with much smaller features that might be better described as drumlins (e.g. Fig. 4B and C). This is plainly illustrated on plots of bedform length from both the entire flow-set and the DLIS transect (Fig. 6), which overlap. Third, a comparison of our quantitative data (length, width and elongation ratio) with those from a large database of drumlins from Britain and Ireland (Clark et al., 2009) also reveals populations that overlap, especially in terms of length, see Fig. 15. If the MSGL were a separate 'species' of bedform, one might expect histograms to reveal two separate populations (e.g. Fig. 14).

We therefore conclude that the features that fit the broad category of MSGLs on the DLIS bed are simply attenuated variants of more classic drumlins, with which they are clearly interspersed on a continuum. Indeed, the mean values for planar asymmetry are almost identical, with our MSGL-like features giving a mean value of 0.52 (90% between 0.45 and 0.59) and Spagnolo's et al.'s (2010) analysis of drumlins giving a value of 0.51 (81% between 0.45 and 0.55). Thus, the DLIS MSGL share characteristics with drumlins (Clark et al., 2009) in showing a unimodal distribution of size and shape (size-specificity: cf. Evans, 2010); have a short and steep lower limit, suggestive of a physical threshold for formation of the order of 100 m; and have a long, upper 'tail' that gradually reduces



**Fig. 9.** Histogram and summary statistics for a simple measurement of the planar (plan form) asymmetry of bedforms within the DLIS transect (n = 17,038). A value of 0.5 indicates a perfectly symmetrical shape. Higher values indicate upstream halves that are larger than downstream halves (i.e. classically asymmetric: Fig. 3b) and lower values indicating downstream halves that are larger than upstream halves (i.e. reversed asymmetry: Fig. 3d). Bin size is 0.2. Box-and-whisker plot shows the 25 and 75th percentiles (grey box), the 10th and 90<sup>th</sup> percentiles (whisker ends) and the 5th and 95th percentiles (black dots). The mean (horizontal line) and median (dashed horizontal line) are also shown (overlapping).

with no obvious limit or cut-off, i.e. there appears to be no physical reason why MSGLs cannot grow longer or wider.

## 5.2. Insights regarding bedform attenuation and elongation

Although there is persuasive evidence that the MSGLs on the DLIS bed are closely (probably genetically) related to shorter, less elongate drumlins, it is instructive to examine closely the ways in which they are subtly different and explore their possible evolution from shorter bedforms. Interestingly, the comparison to British and Irish drumlins (Clark et al., 2009) shows that the MSGL on the DLIS bed completely overlap and simply extend the values of length (Fig. 15a). The same could be said for their elongation ratios

(Fig. 15c), although there is less overlap at mid-range elongation ratios (around 5:1), which might suggest some form of 'jump' (rapid transition) from drumlins through to MSGL. Of most significance, however, is that the greatest differences are seen in terms of the width of the two populations (Fig. 15b): British and Irish drumlins, although clearly shorter, are typically much wider than the bedforms in our DLIS transect.

An obvious implication is that the higher elongation ratios of the MSGL on the DLIS bed are related to their extreme length *and* their reduced width, rather than just their length. Put another way, if higher bedform elongation ratios (e.g. >10:1) are related to higher ice velocities (cf. Hart, 1999; Stokes and Clark, 2002; Briner, 2007); then one impact of rapid ice flow is to reduce bedform width as well



**Fig. 10.** Glacial lineations from the DLIS transect shaded according to their planar shape. Most lineations are approximately symmetrical in plan form (yellow: Fig. 3c), but there are isolated cases of those that show both reverse asymmetry (blue: Fig. 3d) and classic asymmetry (red: Fig. 3b), the latter sometimes clustering in groups of 5–10 bedforms, while the former are much more rare and more likely to be isolated.





**Fig. 11.** Plots of lineation density (point per unit area) in (A) and cumulative lineation length per unit area in (B) across the entire DLIS flow-set. Although there is considerable heterogeneity, both plots reveal high densities of lineations towards the terminus of the flow-set, where numerous smaller bedforms occur (cf. Fig. 4). When the cumulative length of the bedforms is included (B), regions of the central narrower trunk emerge as dense areas of bedforms. Note that edge effects are unavoidable and the red fringe is an artefact created by areas of zero bedforms outside the flow-set limit.

as to enhance bedform length. This is further supported by the plots in Fig. 8, which show that the longest bedforms tend to be narrowest (i.e. they are not just bigger in all dimensions: Fig. 8a) and that the widest bedforms tend to have lower elongation ratios (Fig. 8c). The fact that the width and length of MSGL does not vary in a more narrowly constrained fashion (i.e. high  $R^2$  for length versus width) suggests that they are not printed at a set shape (i.e. fixed elongation which then grows proportionally wider and longer), but that their elongation increases more quickly than their





**Fig. 12.** Plot of lineation density (point per unit area) in (A) and lineation packing (total bedform area per unit area) in (B) for the DLIS transect. The data are highly heterogeneous, mostly likely reflecting postglacial fluvial activity carving major river valleys and the presence of large lakes. The additional measurement of 'packing' shows a broadly similar trend to density. Note that edge effects are unavoidable and the red fringe is an artefact created by areas of zero bedforms outside the transect limit.

width, and smoothly and gradually. This is confirmed by a plot of the covariance of length, width and elongation ratio, shown in Fig. 16, which shows a very similar sharply defined lengthdependent elongation limit that was first identified by Clark et al. (2009) in relation to drumlins. For any given length, there is a predictable minimum value of elongation ratio below which no features are found. At its simplest, the key message is that bedforms are never both long and wide and, as such, their length must develop more quickly than their width. This supports the idea that they evolve from stubby to elongate and provides further evidence that their development is allometric, rather than isometric



**Fig. 13.** Histograms and summary statistics of distance between bedforms in the DLIS transect both perpendicular (A) and parallel (B) to ice flow. These data hint at a preferred spacing of MSGLs of between 50 and 250 m apart from their nearest lateral neighbour and 200–850 m for their nearest neighbour along-flow. Bin sizes are 50 m. Box-and-whisker plots show the 25 and 75th percentiles (grey box), the 10th and 90<sup>th</sup> percentiles (whisker ends) and the 5th and 95th percentiles (black dots). The mean (horizontal line) and median (dashed horizontal line) are also shown.

(cf. Evans, 2010). The discovery of the same length-dependent elongation limit for our MSGL also provides further support that they share similarities with drumlins (cf. Section 5.1).

It may be that MSGLs grow longer at the expense of the width, essentially by removing material on the side of the bedforms. Indeed, in our sample, bedforms with an elongation ratio >40:1 are always <400 m wide, those >60:1 are always less than 300 m wide, and those >80:1 are always <200 m wide (Fig. 8c). This would suggest that fast ice flow is somehow not compatible with the formation of wide bedforms, possibly because they will generate excessive drag against the flow (cf. Spagnolo et al., 2012). There is some hint that the attenuation of MSGLs may, therefore, be partly contributed to by erosional processes that removes material from between ridges, causing their width to narrow. Further support for this comes from observations reported in other studies, where lineations that are seen to be composed of mainly till are found with intervening swales extending to and exposing underlying bedrock (e.g. Clark and Stokes, 2001; Ross et al., 2011). Whether material that is removed from between ridges is then recycled back into them or simply deposited further downstream beyond them is unknown, but analysis of their sedimentology on the DLIS bed suggests that their diamicton has undergone relatively short transport distances and incomplete mixing (see Paper 2: Ó Cofaigh et al., 2013). Thus, their great length is unlikely to result only from subglacial deformation that transports sediment down-stream: erosional processes within the grooves must contribute to the excavation of the intra-ridge material.

## 5.3. MSGL as part of a subglacial bedform continuum?

There is compelling evidence that MSGLs on the DLIS bed are highly attenuated variants of drumlins and form an upper 'tail' of bedforms on histograms of length and elongation ratio, rather than a separate species (Fig. 14). This would support the idea that subglacial bedforms (e.g. ribbed moraines, drumlins, MSGLs) might represent a continuum of forms that are genetically related (see e.g. Aario, 1977; Rose, 1987), as illustrated in Fig. 17. However, there are few (if any) quantitative demonstrations of a possible relationship between these bedforms, largely because workers have tended to focus on only one type and partly because, until recently (e.g. Clark et al., 2009), there were few studies with large enough sample sizes to provide a rigorous analysis.

As noted above, the most obvious explanation for the increase in bedform length is ice velocity (e.g. Hart, 1999; Ó Cofaigh et al., 2002; Stokes and Clark, 2002; Briner, 2007; King et al., 2009) and we suggest that, all other things being equal (e.g. sediment availability, till properties, etc.), this is the primary control on the continuum of forms. Indeed, we provide tentative predictions of the likely range of ice velocities that might account for the continuum of forms (Fig. 17), which is based on limited geophysical evidence of drumlins and MSGLs forming beneath modern ice sheets, where velocities are known (e.g. King et al., 2007, 2009); and the observation that ribbed moraines commonly form close to ice divides (Hättestrand and Kleman, 1999). That velocity is a primary control on this continuum is also supported both by observations of gradual transitions of these forms within flow-sets as seen in this study (i.e. representing real but gradual changes in ice velocity) but also the fact that many transitions can occur abruptly (e.g. Dunlop and Clark, 2006). For example, abrupt spatial/lateral transitions from ribbed moraines to drumlins are likely to result from abrupt changes in ice velocity caused by a switch in the basal thermal regime (e.g. Dyke and Morris, 1988; Dyke et al., 1992; Hättestrand and Kleman, 1999). Indeed, the superimposition of ribbed



**Fig. 14.** Two possibilities regarding the morphometric characteristics of subglacial bedforms: the first (A) is redrawn from Clark (1993) and views different bedforms as separate species, with clearly preferred size and shape characteristics. The second (B) appeals to a subglacial bedform continuum (see also Fig. 17), with the each landform genetically related, and with size and shape characteristics falling within one population. The prevailing paradigm is probably that shown in (A), largely because we have, perhaps unfortunately (but understandably), given genetically similar bedforms different names, that reflect their size and shape, which has, in turn, caused many workers to study them separately. In this paper, data appear to indicate that MSGL, at least on the DLIS bed, are simply an extension/variant of highly attenuated drumlins, i.e. scenario shown in (B).

moraines on the DLIS bed has been linked to ice stream shut-down and basal freeze-on (Stokes et al., 2008).

One potential issue with the simplistic view that longer bedforms are related to fast ice flow (cf. Stokes and Clark, 2002) is that small bedforms (drumlins) can occur interspersed with much longer MSGL. A logical progression of the above argument might therefore interpret these features as localised zones of slower ice flow (basal stickiness) and, where they occur as a cluster, this might indeed be the case, especially if they clearly diverge around till free areas or bedrock bumps (cf. Stokes et al., 2007; Phillips et al., 2010). However, it is clear from our analysis that small bedforms can occur in isolation, often sandwiched between two extremely elongate features (see Figss. 2c, 4b and 4c), which is perhaps more difficult to explain.

Several studies have shown that variations in bedform size and shape can arise from variations in underlying geology (Rattas and Piotrowksi, 2003; Greenwood and Clark, 2010; Phillips et al., 2010). Rattas and Piotrowksi (2003), for example, found that smaller and more elongate drumlins were underlain by low permeability bedrock under a small ice stream from the late Weichselian Ice Sheet, whereas larger forms corresponded to higher permeability bedrock. Major bedrock structures and changes in lithology have also been invoked to explain transitions in bedform shape and elongation ratio under parts of the Irish Sea Ice Stream (e.g. Phillips et al., 2010) and, more generally, Greenwood and Clark (2010) noted coincident changes in substrate and bedform morphometry in parts of Ireland.

Under the DLIS, the major geological change is the transition from predominantly crystalline bedrock in the ice stream onset zone (typically massive grainitoid gneisses) to a major sedimentary basin known as the 'Thelon Formation', which underlies most of the narrower main trunk and is characterised by more easily erodible sandstones (Aylsworth and Shilts, 1989b). Previous work (Stokes and Clark, 2002, 2003b, c) noted the broad correspondence



**Fig. 15.** Histograms and summary statistics of the DLIS transect length (a), width (b) and elongation ratio (c) alongside a large database of British drumlins from Clark et al. (2009). DLIS MSGLs are, generally, longer and more elongate, although the populations clearly overlap. The most important difference is that the MSGLs are narrower than drumlins, which helps explain the weak correlation between length and width for MSGL, compared to drumlins (cf. Fig. 8a). Box-and-whisker plots show the 25 and 75th percentiles (grey box), the 10th and 90<sup>th</sup> percentiles (whisker ends) and the 5th and 95th percentiles (black dots). The mean (horizontal line) and median (dashed horizontal line) are also shown.

between the most elongate bedforms and the Thelon sandstones, but also pointed out that the sandstones extend outside of the lateral margins of the ice stream, where no MSGL are found. Furthermore, there is no abrupt transition in bedform elongation ratios (Fig. 4) that coincides with the underlying geological boundaries. We also note that whilst bedrock is close to the surface, and occasionally exposed, on parts of the ice stream bed (see Fig. 10 in paper 2: Ó Cofaigh et al., 2013), there is little correspondence between the spatial variability in the underlying geology, which is of the order of 10s of kilometres (Donaldson, 1969), and the size and shape of clusters of bedforms over similarly scaled patches. Rather, our observations confirm a gradual transition in length and elongation ratio along the flow-set (Fig. 4A), that is only interrupted by highly localised, often isolated, occurrences of short bedforms (e.g. 1 km long), juxtaposed next to those which can exceed 10 km in length (Fig. 4B and C).

Although we cannot rule out the possibility that some small bedforms were simply starved of sediment that prevented their elongation, we view it unlikely that they are a manifestation of a highly localised sticky spot and/or spatial variation in geology/ sediment thickness, and instead appeal to the notion of a dynamic subglacial system (cf. Smith et al., 2007; King et al., 2009; Hillier et al., 2013) whereby lineations are continually being created, remoulded and, in some cases, potentially erased. Even a relatively short-lived episode of ice flow (in this case just a few hundred years: see Section 2), would create a population of bedforms of different ages; just like a snapshot of a human population. Implicit in this argument is that bedforms are created and form relatively rapidly (i.e. in decades rather than over centuries: cf. Smith et al., 2007) and, under ice stream velocities (e.g. 500 m  $a^{-1}$ ), it is not inconceivable that a 50 km long MSGL could form in just 100 years. A further implication is that short bedforms can also be preserved on palaeoice stream beds, but only if they were 'born' just before ice stream shut-down (or deglaciation) and did not have time to 'mature'.

In summary, if MSGL from the Dubawnt Lake ice stream are representative of the wider population of MSGL, which is yet to be



**Fig. 16.** Plot of co-variation of length, width and elongation ratio for the DLIS transect. Note the sharply defined length-dependent elongation ratio that was also identified by Clark et al. (2009) for drumlins. This indicates that a given bedform can only extend to (attain) a certain elongation ratio if its length also extends at a greater rate than does its width. The identification of this same scaling law supports the idea that MSGL are genetically related to drumlins and that they evolve allometrically (cf. Evans, 2010) from stubby to elongate.

demonstrated, they appear to indicate that they are genetically related to drumlins. This supports the notion of a subglacial bedform continuum (cf. Aario, 1977; Rose, 1987) that is predominantly controlled by ice velocity, but which in any given setting is likely to be confounded by the duration of flow and an evolving population of different aged bedforms. The alternative is that some of the larger variants of MSGL may plot as a separate species (i.e. significantly larger, longer, wider), but there is insufficient data to test this at present. Indeed, it is likely that the 'needle-like' DLIS features are at the lower end of MSGL dimensions (see for example bedform lengths and amplitudes in Canals et al., 2000), although this can only be verified by a more comprehensive comparison of MSGL characteristics from a variety of settings.

## 5.4. Qualitative comparison to existing theories of MSGL formation

Various hypotheses have been put forward to explain the formation of MSGLs and these can be summarised as:

- 1. Subglacial deformation of till and attenuation downstream (Clark, 1993)
- 2. Catastrophic meltwater floods (Shaw et al., 2000, 2008)
- 3. 'Groove-ploughing' by roughness elements (keels) in the basal ice (Clark et al., 2003)
- 4. Spiral flows in basal ice (Schoof and Clarke, 2008)
- 5. A rilling instability in the basal hydraulic system (Fowler, 2010)

The first two hypotheses are, essentially, extensions of ideas that have been proposed to explain drumlins and, as such, they appeal to the notion of a subglacial bedform continuum (e.g. Aario, 1977; Rose, 1987). In contrast, the other three hypotheses have departed somewhat from ideas linked to drumlin formation and have instead appealed to processes that might act to carve a grooved till surface. In this section, we review these hypotheses and discuss the extent to which they are compatible with our morphometric data (including any predictions they make).

## 5.4.1. Deformation of till and attenuation downstream

Having formally recognised and named MSGLs, Clark (1993) discussed their possible mode of origin and suggested that it was unlikely that they formed in an almost instantaneous manner (e.g. through fluvial activity or large basal crevasses) due to their great length, straight form and repetitive parallel arrangement. Rather than appeal to a new formative mechanism, Clark suggested that the extensive literature on other ice moulded bedforms provides a useful starting point and that the incremental action of ice flow in streamlining MSGL through subglacial deformation/erosion seemed to be a likely explanation. He argued that if the development of other ice-moulded bedforms, such as drumlins, could initiate by subglacial deformation around inhomogeneities in till (e.g. Boulton, 1987), then similar processes might form MSGL, with



Ice velocity (m a<sup>-1</sup>)

**Fig. 17.** Schematic representation of a subglacial bedform continuum modified from Aario (1977); see also Rose (1987). With this view, a whole spectrum (based on shape) of subglacial bedforms are genetically related (i.e. Fig. 14B, rather than 14A) and merge from one into the other, e.g. from ribbed moraines through to drumlins through to MSGL. All other things being equal (e.g. sediment availability, till properties, etc.) the most obvious control on where a bedform lies along this continuum is ice velocity (see text for discussion).

the difference in scale resulting from variations in the controlling parameters. Specifically, Clark (1993) suggested that basal ice velocities and the duration of flow are the primary controls of MSGL formation and attenuation. He then argued that it was unlikely that ice sheet flow-lines remained stable for long enough to produce MSGL and invoked a relatively rapid formation under extremely high velocities (e.g. surges or ice streams), which has since gained widespread acceptance (cf. Stokes and Clark, 1999; King et al., 2009). Thus, Clark (1993) took the view that MSGLs might be formed under rapid ice velocities, where high strain rates, coupled with a plentiful supply of sediment, might lead to subglacial deformation and attenuation of drumlins into much more elongate MSGLs.

In support of this hypothesis, the Dubawnt Lake MSGLs are formed side-by-side with drumlins and have a slight preference for classical asymmetry (Fig. 9), which suggests that they share a common origin. Furthermore, even the longest lineation on the ice stream bed (~20 km) could have formed in as little as 40 years under basal ice velocities of 500 m  $a^{-1}$ . However, it would appear that MSGLs on the DLIS bed have a preferred spacing, and this is more difficult to reconcile with initiation from pre-existing obstacles/inhomogeneities, which are more likely to be randomly dispersed. On the other hand, perhaps a pattern of 'emergent' MSGL could arise from an instability in the deforming bed (Clark, 2010), as has been hypothesised for drumlins (Hindmarsh, 1998; Fowler, 2000, 2009; Stokes et al., 2013). A more rigorous test of the subglacial deformation hypothesis also requires closer inspection of the composition and internal structure of the MSGLs, and there is evidence from sediment exposures that MSGL on the DLIS bed are characterised by 'cores' that consist of crudely stratified glaciofluvial sediments, overlain by till (see Paper 2: Ó Cofaigh et al., 2013). This observation suggests that any subglacial deforming bed must have eroded down into pre-existing sediments (Boyce and Eyles, 1991; Stokes et al., 2013), unless these sediments were laid down during MSGL formation.

#### 5.4.2. Catastrophic meltwater floods

Shaw et al. (2008) present a radically different interpretation of MSGLs based on observations from Antarctic cross-shelf troughs and invoke catastrophic discharge of turbulent subglacial meltwater. This hypothesis has been applied to drumlin formation (e.g. Shaw, 1983) and large-scale terrestrial flutings (which could equally be termed MSGLs: Shaw et al., 2000) and Shaw et al. (2008). The basis for this theory is the analogy between MSGLs and similar forms and patterns formed by broad, turbulent flows in water and air (e.g. elongate yardangs in aeolian environments, 'rat-tails in fluvial environments, and megafurrows in ocean-floor sediments: see Shaw et al. 2008 and references therein). These flows are known to generate longitudinal vortices when they encounter an obstacle, which then acts to focus meltwater erosion around the stoss end of the resultant bedform and along their flanks. The form analogy is certainly persuasive and Shaw et al. (2008) strengthen their argument by pointing to the abundance of meltwater features and tunnel channels in ice stream onset zones (e.g. crescentric and hairpin scours around the stoss end of drumlins and MSGL), and numerous gullies and channels that often characterise the continental slope.

We note an absence of major drainage/meltwater channels either upstream or downstream of the MSGLs on the DLIS bed. Abundant eskers are present and draped on top of the MSGL, but these are slightly misaligned with the predominant lineation direction (e.g. see Fig. 6 in Stokes and Clark, 2003b), which implies a (unknown) time interval between lineation formation and esker formation. Furthermore, the DLIS MSGL are superimposed by ribbed moraine in some places and it is difficult to envisage how one or more meltwater floods might have produced MSGL, then ribbed moraine (but without substantial modification of the underlying MSGL) and then a sequence of misaligned eskers.

Intriguingly, we note that some of the MSGL on the DLIS bed appear to have over-deepenings at their stoss end (e.g. Fig. 5C). However, such over-deepenings could equally form by localised subglacial meltwater erosion (hence explaining their sporadic appearance) and/or by proglacial meltwater erosion (cf. Ó Cofaigh et al., 2010). There is also an issue as to whether the magnitude of meltwater required to form such floods is plausible (e.g. Clarke et al., 2005). It is difficult to envisage how a flow-set ranging from 350 to 140 km in width and >450 km long could be formed by a catastrophic flood that left minimal evidence of meltwater erosional features (major channels, lag deposits, etc.). Finally, the absence of any evidence for a meltwater flood during MSGL formation under Rutford Ice Stream in West Antarctica (King et al., 2009) would appear to favour a mechanism invoking ice flow interacting with soft, saturated till. Shaw and Young (2010) acknowledge that the data from King et al. (2009) "oblige us to take a long, hard look at the megaflood hypothesis" (p. 199) and we therefore consider it unlikely that the DLIS MSGL were formed through this mechanism (cf. Paper 2: Ó Cofaigh et al., 2013).

## 5.4.3. 'Groove-ploughing'

Based on observations that the appearance of MSGLs resembles a corrugated or grooved till surface (e.g. Dean, 1953; Lemke, 1958; Heidenreich, 1964; Stokes and Clark, 2003a), Clark et al. (2003) proposed a 'groove-ploughing' hypothesis. The central tenet of this hypothesis is that the base of the ice is a rough surface (with bumps of the order  $10-10^3$ ). Indeed, observations of 'flowstripes' on the surface of ice streams support this view because rapidly sliding ice is exceedingly 'transparent' to the bed topography, i.e. if the bed is corrugated, the surface will reflect this at certain wavelengths (Gudmundsson et al., 1998). Recent work has also shown that flow convergence can generate flow-stripes through transverse compressional strain and longitudinal extension, which characterises ice stream onset zones (Glasser and Gudmundsson, 2012). With this in mind, Clark et al. (2003) argued that major roughness elements in the ice base (referred to as 'keels') passing over a weak and poorly consolidated bed of soft saturated sediments (again, characteristic of most ice stream beds) could plough through these sediments and carve elongate grooves, deforming material up into intervening ridges. As Clark et al. (2003) note, a critical aspect of this theory is the ability of the grooves to plough through sediment for a sufficient distance (several kms) without thermodynamic and mechanical degradation. They demonstrate that larger keels (e.g. 30 m wavelength, 5 m amplitude) are more likely to survive (e.g. Thorsteinsson and Raymond, 2000) and that survival distances of 10-100 km are plausible, depending on ice velocity (Thorsteinsson and Raymond, 2000; Tulaczyk et al., 2001; Clark et al., 2003).

In order to facilitate testing of their hypothesis, Clark et al. (2003) make several predictions of the nature of the geomorphology of the MSGL that should arise from groove-ploughing. One prediction is that MSGLs should be common downstream of regions where basal ice roughness is produced (i.e. contact with hard bedrock and/or flow convergence). This prediction is certainly fulfilled for the DLIS bed, where MSGLs are only located in the narrow main trunk, immediately downstream of a major zone of flow convergence (Fig. 4). Although there is no obvious transition from hard bedrock to soft sediments in the ice stream onset zone (De Angelis and Kleman, 2008), we note that the DLIS bed is characterised by a relatively thin till cover (ranging from exposed bedrock to several metres thick). A further prediction is that the transverse roughness of ice stream beds should greatly exceed longitudinal roughness (Clark et al., 2003) and while we have not explicitly measured or quantified roughness, it is clear that this is likely to be the case (see Fig. 5).

Clark et al. (2003) also predict that the transverse groovespacing should be related to the spatial frequency of bedrock roughness but we are unable to test this prediction without a more thorough analysis of where bedrock roughness exists. However, very few MSGL are associated with exposed bedrock at the stoss end (e.g. Fig. 5). Elsewhere, it is also known that MSGLs occur in areas lacking bedrock outcrops and where Quaternary sediments exceed 100 m in thickness, e.g. Canadian Prairies (Ross et al., 2009). Thus, although we cannot rule out the possibility that bedrock obstacles may exist beneath the till surface on the DLIS, we deem this unlikely because a preferred lateral spacing (Fig. 13A) is difficult to reconcile with a preferred spacing of bedrock obstacles. Indeed, Clark et al. (2003) proposed that the spacing of grooves should change in proportion to the amount of roughness, with spacing between lineations greatest in the wider convergence zone, rather than the narrower main trunk. Our analysis of bedform density across the ice stream (e.g. Fig. 11) reveals no obvious pattern towards a higher density of bedforms (and intervening grooves) in the central trunk. There are low density patches in the onset zone and high densities in the narrow trunk, but there are even higher densities towards the terminus (Fig. 11A).

Arguably, the most critical prediction of the theory is that groove width and depth should decrease as it passes downstream, i.e. as the keel melts out, the groove becomes shallower and, as a result, the lateral edges of the two neighbouring bedforms should increase in distance downstream as they become more tapered. Although we have not measured this directly, there is little evidence in the detailed mapping (e.g. Figs. 2 and 4) that neighbouring bedforms become more tapered downstream. Moreover, analysis of their plan-form (Fig. 9) suggests that most bedforms are approximately symmetric and lack a tapered lee end, although we note small clusters of bedforms that exhibit the classic asymmetry predicted by the groove-ploughing hypothesis (Fig. 10b). We also observe the initiation of bedforms within grooves (e.g. Fig. 2C), which is difficult to reconcile with groove-ploughing, unless these bedforms are seeded by roughness elements within/beneath the till laver.

Thus, there is some observational support for groove-ploughing, but it is also clear that this process cannot explain all of the observations and that it is likely that a more pervasive mechanism should be invoked. This same conclusion is implicit in Clark et al. (2003) who drew attention to an antecedent drumlinised surface which was later subjected to localised groove-ploughing (see their Fig. 3) and who also pointed out that an episode of groove-ploughing may provide the necessary relief amplification to begin to 'seed' subglacial bedforms. Clark et al. (2003) do not suppose that groove-ploughing always occurs under ice streams, but that it may occur under appropriate conditions. Such conditions may have occurred transiently on the DLIS bed and the preservation of pre-existing glaciofluvial sediments within the ridges (Paper 2: Ó Cofaigh et al., 2013) is consistent with erosional processes contributing to their development.

#### 5.4.4. Spiral flows in basal ice

Schoof and Clarke (2008) proposed that subglacial flutes may be formed through a transverse secondary flow in basal ice and explore the possibility that such a mechanism could account for much larger megaflutes/MSGLs. They propose that a corkscrew-like spiral flow could remove sediment from troughs between flutes and deposit it at their crest. This was first suggested by Shaw and Freschauf (1973) on the basis of herringbone-type patterns in clast fabrics from within flutes (see also Rose, 1989) that were suggestive of stress patterns that indicate transport of material from interflute troughs towards flute ridges. Thus, the hypothesis shares similarities with both groove-ploughing (Clark et al., 2003) and mega-floods (Shaw et al., 2008) in terms of the focus on excavating grooves to build the ridges. The key departure from these hypotheses, however, is that Schoof and Clarke's (2008) treatment does not require any initiating protuberance, either in the bed or the ice, although that is not to say that such obstacles will not form bedforms when they occur.

Schoof and Clarke (2008) acknowledge that the generation of secondary flows in ice is not straightforward (unlike for example, in the turbulent flow of water) and so they explore ways of generating secondary flows based on a non-Newtonian rheology (i.e. departing from more standard assumptions: Paterson, 1994; chapter 5). Specifically, they require that the rheology of ice allows for the generation of deviatoric normal stresses transverse to the main ice flow direction, a characteristic of nonlinearly viscous and viscoelastic fluids described by a Reiner-Rivlin rheology. They note that the possibility of the normal stress effects they describe was acknowledged in the original paper by Glen (1958) and they also highlight experimental evidence (e.g. McTigue et al., 1985) that indicates that the deviatoric stress generated by a given strain rate is not, in general, parallel to the strain rate tensor; and that simple shearing flow will generate normal stresses perpendicular to the flow direction.

Whilst explicitly emphasising that their hypothesis is conceptual, Schoof and Clarke (2008) demonstrate numerically that small undulations in the bed in conjunction with normal stress effects in the ice can cause the formation of such secondary flows and the subsequent amplification of the bed undulations, i.e. that the flow of ice close to the bed can be directed towards flute crests. They then explore various parameter values and speculate that small bedforms (e.g. low relief flutes) could form relatively quickly (few decades, rather than centuries), which is compatible with observations (e.g. Rose, 1989). However, formation of a 300 m wide MSGL would require about 1000 years, which is inconsistent with rapid evolution of bedforms reported under Rutford Ice Stream (Smith et al., 2007; King et al., 2009) and, indeed, the longevity of the Dubawnt Lake Ice Stream (Stokes and Clark, 2003b). They concede, therefore, that the growth rates predicted by the theory, at least in its current form, are insufficient to generate the large-scale flutings formed by the major mid-latitude ice sheets; but they further point out that this conclusion is dependent on the parameterisation of subglacial sediment transport, which is only poorly understood. Thus, although it holds promise in terms of predicting assemblages of evenly spaced lineations, which our data support, we view it unlikely that the DLIS MSGL were formed through this mechanism, given their large size and the non-standard assumptions regarding ice rheology.

#### 5.4.5. Rilling instability

A rilling instability theory was recently put forward by Fowler (2010), which is an extension of the instability theory for drumlin formation (Hindmarsh, 1998; Fowler, 2000, 2009; Schoof, 2007), but which includes a dynamic description of the local subglacial drainage system. Specifically, Fowler (2010) demonstrates that a uniform water-film flowing between ice and deformable subglacial till is unstable and rilling will occur, similar to that in a subaerial setting and which results in a number of streams separated by intervening ridges. In common with mathematical treatments seeking to explain the formation of drumlins (Fowler, 2000, 2009) and ribbed moraines (Dunlop et al., 2008) from an unstable till layer, the theory is capable of making quantitative predictions of bedform dimensions. For the particular choice of parameters used in Fowler (2010), the preferred spacing (distance to nearest lateral

neighbour) is 394 m; the preferred length scale is 52.9 km and the elevation scale is 12.3 m.

The predicted lateral spacing of MSGL is relatively close to that which is observed (mean of 233 m: see Section 4.4), but this is strongly dependent on the choice of parameters selected. The predicted length scales are also the same order of magnitude. although a predicted value of 52.9 km is much longer than is observed on the DLIS bed (max. length observed = 20.1 km). As noted above, we have no systematic measurements of MSGL elevation but observations in the field show ridges typically between 5 and 15 m high, which is similar to those predicted in Fowler (2010). Furthermore, it is implicit in the rilling instability that ridges should show a preferred spacing in the transverse direction, i.e. a pattern of roughly equally spaced ridges, rather than a more random distribution. Although we have not performed a systematic analysis of bedform patterning (e.g. regular v. random) we note that the lateral spacing reveals a unimodal distribution (Fig. 13). Thus, preliminary predictions of the rilling instability appear to be consistent with the characteristics of MSGL on the DLIS bed and, as such, it appears to be a promising explanation that deserves further attempts at falsification.

## 5.4.6. Summary

Four of the five existing hypotheses for MSGL formation focus primarily on the production of intervening grooves, rather than building of ridges (e.g. through ploughing of ice keels, subglacial meltwater flow, or spiral flows in basal ice), and this is consistent with our data which seems to require width to reduce as bedforms attenuate. However, no single theory is developed to the stage where it is sufficient to explain their formation. Subglacial deformation of till and attenuation downstream is plausible, but observations of stratified cores (see Paper 2: Ó Cofaigh et al., 2013) suggests that this process was not pervasive, and the preferred spacing of MSGLs is unlikely to match the location of pre-existing obstacles and/or inhomogeneities. The meltwater flood theory (Shaw et al., 2008) is rejected on the basis of the lack of evidence of meltwater erosion (tunnel valleys, channels, lag deposits, etc.); concerns over the magnitude of water required to be stored and released; and the preservation (rather than removal by catastrophic floods), in places, of three generations of bedform-ing events (first MSGL, then ribbed moraines, then eskers). Notwithstanding the assumptions regarding the nonstandard rheology of ice, spiral flows in basal ice (Schoof and Clarke, 2008) are also rejected because the theory, at least in its present form, is unable to grow sufficiently large MSGL within the timeframes of their generation. There is limited evidence to support groove-ploughing (Clark et al., 2003), but if this process did occur, it was at most, limited in both space and time. The rilling instability theory (Fowler, 2010) shows promise in terms of predicting both the spacing and length of MSGL, but these predictions are heavily dependent on the choice of parameters and a more comprehensive evaluation of their sensitivity is yet to be undertaken.

Given that our data would appear to favour a subglacial bedform continuum, with MSGLs being more extreme/elongate variants of drumlins, future work might want to focus on a unifying theory that explains a range of subglacial bedforms (Stokes et al., 2011), rather than appealing to 'special' circumstances to only explain MSGLs (cf. Clark, 2010). However, it should be emphasised that the data from this paper represent a single case study and, as discussed above, it may be that the MSGLs on the DLIS might be better described as drumlins. This assumes that there are two separate 'species' of bedform, which has yet to be demonstrated and this is a key area for future work to address.

#### 6. Conclusions

This paper provides the first substantive dataset (17,038 lineations) on the size, shape and spacing of a zone of MSGLs from the central trunk of Dubawnt Lake palaeo-ice stream bed (Stokes and Clark, 2003b, c). Mapping from a central transect across the width of the ice stream which incorporates, but does not arbitrarily select. the most elongate lineations indicates a mean length of 945 m (min = 186; max = 20146); a mean width of 117 m (min = 39;max = 553), and a mean elongation ratio (length: width) of 8.7 (min = 2.2, max = 149.1). Analysis of their plan-form shows that most lineations are approximately symmetric, but with a very slight tendency to possess an upstream half that is larger than their downstream half. Lineations show a dominant lateral spacing, with a mean of 234 m (min = 0, max = 5104) and a slightly less dominant longitudinal spacing with a mean 625 m (min = 0.05, max = 8285). The unimodal distribution of these data hints at a regular patterning of MSGLs, rather than a more random distribution, although confirmation of this awaits more rigorous analysis from other ice stream beds.

A key conclusion is that these data clearly show a mixed population of lineations with features characteristic of MSGL interspersed with much smaller lineations that might be more appropriately termed drumlins. Given that there is no obvious and abrupt spatial transition, we suggest that they form part of a subglacial bedform continuum (cf. Aario, 1977; Rose, 1987) and that MSGL in this location are simply an extension of drumlins. Comparison to a large database of British and Irish drumlins (Clark et al., 2009) confirms this supposition, showing that our data simply extend the length and elongation range of drumlins, i.e. they do not plot as separate populations. The largest difference is found in terms of their width, with MSGLs typically much narrower than drumlins. This suggests that one impact of rapid ice flow is to create narrower bedforms as well as attenuating their length. Thus, our data strongly favour a subglacial bedform continuum that is primarily controlled by ice velocity, but which is confounded by the duration of ice flow and the fact that new bedforms are continually being created, remoulded, and, ultimately, erased. Given that the Dubawnt Lake Ice Stream only operated for a relatively short period of time (just a few hundred years: Stokes and Clark, 2003c), a further implication is that MSGL formation (and subglacial bedforms more generally) are likely to be created over time-scales of decades, rather than centuries. Hence, theories of bedform creation ought to meet this requirement.

Comparison of our data with existing theories of MSGL formation suggest than none are wholly sufficient to explain their characteristics. We find little support for ideas based on spiral flows in basal ice (Schoof and Clarke, 2008) or catastrophic meltwater floods (Shaw et al., 2008); although neither of their proponents claim to offer a universal explanation and the former specifically acknowledge their inability to capture the rapid growth of large MSGL. It is possible that transient groove-ploughing (Clark et al., 2003) occurred and we are unable to falsify a recent model presented by Fowler (2010), albeit in its infancy, that invokes a rilling instability whereby subglacial meltwater removes sediment from between neighbouring ridges. Thus, a tentative conclusion would be that the mechanism of MSGL formation occurs over decadal time-scales and involves both subglacial deformation of sediment and erosion of the intervening grooves (see also Paper 2: Ó Cofaigh et al., 2013), but there is a clear requirement for further theoretical work on MSGL formation and the generation of testable predictions.

## Acknowledgements

This work was funded primarily by UK Natural Environment Research Council grants to CRS (NER/M/S/2003/00050) and MS (NE/ J004766/1). Additional support was provided by a Natural Science and Engineering Research Council (NSERC) of Canada Discovery Grant to OBL. The Nunavut Research Institute is thanked for providing a scientific research license and Rob Currie, Mark Loewen and Boris Kotelewetz are thanked for their unstinting field assistance and logistical support. CRS would like to acknowledge further financial support from a Philip Leverhulme Prize, which helped facilitate a sabbatical at the University of California, Santa Cruz. We thank the editor (Neil Glasser) and thoughtful reviews by Martin Ross, John Shaw (Geological Survey of Canada) and an anonymous referee.

## References

- Aario, R., 1977. Classification and terminology or morainic landforms in Finland. Boreas 6, 87–100.
- Aylsworth, J.M., Shilts, W.W., 1989a. Bedforms of the Keewatin Ice Sheet, Canada. Sedimentary Geology 62, 407–428.
- Aylsworth, J.M., Shilts, W.W., 1989b. Glacial Features Around the Keewatin Ice Divide: Districts of Mackenzie and Keewatin. Geological Survey of Canada, p. 21. Paper 88-24.
- Baranowski, S., 1977. Regularity of drumlin distribution and the origin of their formation. Studia Geologica Polonica 52, 53–68.
- Bird, J.B., 1953. The glaciation of central Keewatin, Northwest territories, Canada. American Journal of Science 251, 215–230.
- Boots, B.N., Burns, R.K., 1984. Analyzing the spatial distribution of drumlins: a twophase mosaic approach. Journal of Glaciology 30 (106), 302–307.
- Boulton, G.S., 1987. A theory of drumlin formation by subglacial sediment deformation. In: Menzies, J., Rose, J. (Eds.), Drumlin Symposium. A.A. Balkema, Rotterdam, pp. 25–80.
- Boulton, G.S., Clark, C.D., 1990. A highly mobile Laurentide ice sheet revealed by satellite images of glacial lineations. Nature 346, 813–817.
- Boyce, J.I., Eyles, N., 1991. Drumlins carved by deforming till streams below the Laurentide ice sheet. Geology 19, 787–790.
- Bradwell, T., Stoker, M., Krabbendarn, M., 2008. Megagrooves and streamlined bedrock in NW Scotland: the role of ice streams in landscape evolution. Geomorphology 97 (1–2), 135–156.
- Briner, J.P., 2007. Supporting evidence from the New York drumlin field that elongate subglacial bedforms indicate fast ice flow. Boreas 36 (2), 143–147.
- Canals, M., Urgeles, R., Calafat, A.M., 2000. Deep sea-floor evidence of past ice streams off the Antarctic Peninsula. Geology 28 (1), 31–34.
- Chorley, R.J., 1959. The shape of drumlins. Journal of Glaciology 3, 339–344. Christoffersen, P., Tulaczyk, S., 2003. Signature of palaeo-ice stream stagnation: till
- consolidation induced by basal freeze-on. Boreas 32, 114–129. Clark, C.D., 1993. Mega-scale glacial lineations and cross-cutting ice-flow landforms. Earth Surface Processes and Landforms 18, 1–29.
- Clark, C.D., 1997. Reconstructing the evolutionary dynamics of former ice sheets using multi-temporal evidence, remote sensing and GIS. Quaternary Science Reviews 16 (9), 1067–1092.
- Clark, C.D., 2010. Emergent drumlins and their clones: from till dilatancy to flow instabilities. Journal of Glaciology 51 (200), 1011–1025.
- Clark, C.D., Stokes, C.R., 2001. Extent and basal characteristics of the M'Clintock Channel Ice Stream. Quaternary International 86, 81–101.
- Clark, C.D., Tulaczyk, S.M., Stokes, C.R., Canals, M., 2003. A groove-ploughing theory for the production of mega-scale glacial lineations, and implications for icestream mechanics. Journal of Glaciology 49, 240–256.
- Clark, C.D., Hughes, A.L.C., Greenwood, S.L., Spagnolo, M., Ng, F.S.L., 2009. Size and shape characteristics of drumlins, derived from a large sample, and associated scaling laws. Quaternary Science Reviews 28 (7–8), 677–692.
- Clarke, G.K.C., Leverington, D.W., Teller, J.T., Dyke, A.S., Marshall, S.J., 2005. Fresh arguments against the Shaw megaflood hypothesis. A reply to comments by David Sharpe on "Paleohydraulics of the last outburst from glacial Lake Agassiz and the 8200 BP cold event". Quaternary Science Reviews 24, 1533–1541.
- Craig, B.G., 1964. Surficial geology of east-central District of Mackenzie. Geological Survey of Canada Bulletin 99, 1–41.
- Dean, W.G., 1953. The drumlinoid land forms of the Barren Grounds. Canadian Geographer 1, 19–30.
- De Angelis, H., Kleman, J., 2008. Palaeo-ice stream onsets: examples from the northeastern Laurentide Ice Sheet. Earth Surface Processes and Landforms 33 (4), 560-572.
- Donaldson, J.A., 1969. Geology, Central Thelon Plain, Districts of Keewatin and Mackenzie. Geological Survey of Canada. Preliminary Map 16-1968, 1969, 1 sheet.
- Dyke, A.S., Morris, T.F., 1988. Canadian Landform Examples, 7. Drumlin fields, dispersal trains, and ice streams in Arctic Canada. Canadian Geographer 32 (1), 86–90.
- Dyke, A.S., Morris, T.F., Green, E.C., England, J., 1992. Quaternary Geology of Prince of Wales Island, Arctic Canada. Geological Survey of Canada, p. 433.
- Dunlop, P., Clark, C.D., 2006. The morphological characteristics of ribbed moraine. Quaternary Science Reviews 25 (13–14), 1668–1691.
- Dunlop, P., Clark, C.D., Hindmarsh, R.C.A., 2008. Bed ribbing instability explanation: testing a numerical model of ribbed moraine formation arising from the

coupled flow of ice and subglacial sediment. Journal of Geophysical Research 113 (F3), F03005. http://dx.doi.org/10.1029/2007JF000954).

- Dyke, A.S., Moore, A., Robertson, L., 2003. Deglaciation of North America. Geological Survey of Canada. Open File 1574.
- Evans, I.S., 2010. Allometry, scaling and scale-specificity of cirques, landslides and other landforms. Transactions of the Japanese Geomorphological Union 31 (2), 133–153.
- Fowler, A.C., 2000. An instability mechanism for drumlin formation. In: Maltman, A., Hambrey, M.J., Hubbard, B. (Eds.), Deformation of Glacial Materials, Special Publication of the Geological Society, vol. 176. The Geological Society, London, pp. 307–319.
- Fowler, A.C., 2009. Instability modelling of drumlin formation incorporating leeside cavity growth. Proceedings of the Royal Society of London, Series A 466 (2121), 2673–2694.
- Fowler, A.C., 2010. The formation of subglacial streams and mega-scale glacial lineations. Proceedings of the Royal Society of London, Series A 466 (2123), 3181– 3201.
- Glasser, N.F., Gudmundsson, G.H., 2012. Longitudinal surface structures (flowstripes) on Antarctic glaciers. The Cryosphere 6, 383–391.
- Glen, J.W., 1958. The flow of ice: a discussion of the assumptions made in glacier theory, their experimental foundation and consequences. In: Physics of the Movement of Ice – Symposium at Chamonix, 1958, vol. 47. IASH Publication, pp. 171–183.
- Graham, A.G.C., Larter, R.D., Gohl, K., Hillenbrand, C.-D., Smith, J.A., Kuhn, G., 2009. Bedform signature of a West Antarctic palaeo-ice stream reveals a multitemporal record of flow and substrate control. Quaternary Science Reviews 28, 2774–2793.
- Greenwood, S.L., Clark, C.D., 2010. The sensitivity of subglacial bedform size and distribution to substrate lithological control. Sedimentary Geology 232, 130–144.
- Gudmundsson, G.H., Raymond, C.F., Bidschadler, R., 1998. The origin and longevity of flow stripes on Antarctic ice streams. Annals of Glaciology 27, 145–152.
- Hart, J.K., 1999. Identifying fast ice flow from the landform assemblages in the geological record: a discussion. Annals of Glaciology 28, 59–66.
- Hättestrand, C., Kleman, J., 1999. Ribbed moraine formation. Quaternary Science Reviews 18, 43–61.
- Heidenreich, C., 1964. Some observations on the shape of drumlins. Canadian Geographer 8, 101–107.
- Hess, D.P., Briner, J.P., 2009. Geospatial analysis of controls on subglacial bedform morphometry in the New York drumlin field — implications for Laurentide Ice Sheet dynamics. Earth Surface Processes and Landforms 24, 1126–1135.
- Hillier, J.K., Smith, M.J., Clark, C.D., Stokes, C.R., Spagnolo, M., 2013. Subglacial bedforms reveal an exponential size-frequency distribution. Geomorphology 190, 82–91.
- Hindmarsh, R.C.A., 1998. The stability of a viscous till sheet coupled with ice flow, considered at wavelengths less than the ice thickness. Journal of Glaciology 44, 285–292.
- Jezek, K., Wu, X., Gogineni, P., Rodríguez, E., Freeman, A., -Morales, Rodriguez, Clark, C.D., 2011. Radar images of the bed of the Greenland Ice Sheet. Geophysical Research Letters 38 (1). http://dx.doi.org/10.1029/2010GL045519.
- King, E.C., Woodward, J., Smith, A.M., 2007. Seismic and radar observations of subglacial bedforms beneath the onset zone of Rutford Ice Stream, Antarctica. Journal of Glaciology 53 (183), 665–672.
- King, E.C., Hindmarsh, R.C.A., Stokes, C.R., 2009. Formation of mega-scale glacial lineations observed beneath a West Antarctic ice stream. Nature Geoscience 2, 585–588.
- Kleman, J., Borgström, I., 1996. Reconstruction of palaeo-ice sheets: the use of geomorphological data. Earth Surface Processes and Landforms 21, 893–909.
- Lemke, R.W., 1958. Narrow linear drumlins near Velva, North Dakota. American Journal of Science 256, 270–283.
- Livingstone, S.J., O'Cofaigh, C.O., Stokes, C.R., Hillenbrand, C.-D., Vieli, A., Jamieson, S.R., 2012. Antarctic palaeo-ice streams. Earth-Science Reviews 111, 90–128.
- McMartin, I., Henderson, P.J., 2004. Evidence from Keewatin (central Nunavut) for paleo-ice divide migration. Géographie physique et Quaternaire 58 (2/3), 163– 186.
- McTigue, D.F., Passman, S.L., Jones, S.J., 1985. Normal stress effects in the creep of ice. Journal of Glaciology 33 (115), 268–273.
- Ó Cofaigh, C., Pudsey, C.J., Dowdeswell, J.A., Morris, P., 2002. Evolution of subglacial bedforms along a paleo-ice stream, Antarctic Peninsula continental shelf. Geophysical Research Letters 29, 1199. http://dx.doi.org/10.1029/2001GL014488.
- Ó Cofaigh, C., Dowdeswell, J.D., Allen, C.S., Hiemstra, J.F., Pudsey, C.F., Evans, J., Evans, D.J.A., 2005. Flow dynamics and till genesis associated with a marinebased Antarctic palaeo-ice stream. Quaternary Science Reviews 24, 709–740.
- Ó Cofaigh, C., Dowdeswell, J.D., King, E.C., Anderson, J.B., Clark, C.D., Evans, D.J.A., Evans, J., Hindmarsh, R.C.A., Larter, R.D., Stokes, C.R., 2010. Comment on Shaw J., Pugin, A. and Young, R. (2008): "A meltwater origin for Antarctic shelf bedforms with special attention to megalineations". Geomorphology 102, 364–375. Geomorphology, 117, 195–198.
- Ó Cofaigh, C., Stokes, C.R., Lian, O.B., Clark, C.D., Tulaczyk, S.M., 2013. Formation of mega-scale glacial lineations on the Dubawnt Lake Ice Stream bed: 2. Sedimentology and stratigraphy. Quaternary Science Reviews 77, 190–209.

Paterson, W.S.B., 1994. The Physics of Glaciers, third ed. Pergamon, Oxford, London.

Phillips, E., Everest, J., Diaz-Doce, D., 2010. Bedrock controls on subglacial landform distribution and geomorphological processes: evidence from the Late Devensian Irish Sea Ice Stream. Sedimentary Geology 232, 98–118.

- Prest, V.K., Grant, D.R., Rampton, V.N., 1968. Glacial Map of Canada. Geological Survey of Canada. Map 1253A, scale 1:5,000,000.
- Pritchard, H.D., Arthern, R.J., Vaughan, D.G., Edwards, L.A., 2009. Extensive dynamic thinning on the margins of the Greenland and Antarctic ice sheets. Nature 461 (7266), 971–975.
- Rattas, M., Piotrowski, J.A., 2003. Influence of bedrock permeability and till grain size on the formation of the Saadjärve drumlin field, Estonia, under an east-Baltic Weichsealian ice stream. Boreas 32, 167–177.
- Rose, J., 1987. Drumlins as part of a glacier bedform continuum. In: Menzies, J., Rose, J. (Eds.), Drumlin Symposium. A.A. Balkema, Rotterdam, pp. 103–116.
- Rose, J., 1989. Glacier stress patterns and sediment transfer associatyed with the formation of superimposed flutes. Sedimentary Geology 62, 151–176.
- Ross, M., Campbell, J.E., Parent, M., Adams, R.S., 2009. Palaeo-ice streams and the subglacial landscape mosaic of the North American mid-continental prairies. Boreas 38, 421–439.
- Ross, M., Lajeunesse, P., Kosar, A., 2011. The subglacial record of northern Hudson Bay: insights into the Hudson Strait Ice Stream catchment. Boreas 40 (1), 73–91.
- Schoof, C., 2007. Pressure-dependent viscosity and interfacial instability in coupled ice-sediment flow. Journal of Fluid Mechanics 570, 227–252.
- Schoof, C., Clarke, G.K.C., 2008. A model for spiral flows in basal ice and the formation of subglacial flutes based on a Reiner-Rivlin rheology for glacial ice. Journal of Geophysical Research 113. B05204.
- Shaw, J., 1983. Drumlin formation related to inverted melt-water erosional marks. Journal of Glaciology 29 (103), 461–479.
- Shaw, J., Freschauf, R.C., 1973. A kinematic discussion of the formation of glacial flutings. Canadian Geographer 17 (1), 19–35.
- Shaw, J., Young, R.R., 2010. Reply to comment by Ó Cofaigh, Dowdeswell, king, Anderson, Clark, DJA Evans, J. Evans, Hinidmarsh, Lardner [sic] and Stokes "Comments on Shaw, J., Pugin, A., Young, R. (2009): A meltwater origin for Antarctic Shelf bedforms with special attention to megalineations." Geomorphology 102, 364–375. Geomorphology, 117, 199–201.
- Shaw, J., Faragini, D.M., Kvill, D.R., Rains, B.R., 2000. The Athabasca fluting field, Alberta, Canada: implications for the formation of large-scale fluting (erosional lineations). Quaternary Science Reviews 19 (10), 959–980.
- Shaw, J., Pugin, A., Young, R.R., 2008. A meltwater origin for Antarctic shelf bedforms with special attention to megalineations. Geomorphology 102, 364–375.
- Shipp, S.S., Anderson, J.B., Domack, E.W., 1999. Late Pleistocene-Holocene retreat of the West Antarctic ice-sheet system in the Ross Sea: Part 1 – geophysical results. Geological Society of America, Bulletin 111 (10), 1486–1516.
- Smalley, I.J., Unwin, D.J., 1968. The formation and shapes of drumlins and their distribution and orientation in drumlin fields. Journal of Glaciology 7, 377–390.
- Smith, A., Murray, T., Nicholls, K., Makinson, K., Adalgeirsdottir, G., 2007. rapid erosion, drumlin formation, and changing hydrology beneath an Antarctic ice stream. Geology 35 (2), 127–130.
- Spagnolo, M., Clark, C.D., Hughes, A.L.C., Dunlop, P., Stokes, C.R., 2010. The planar shape of drumlins. Sedimentary Geology 232, 119–129.

- Spagnolo, M., Clark, C.D., Hughes, A.L.C., Dunlop, P., 2011. The topography of drumlins: assessing their long profile shape. Earth Surface Processes and Landforms 36, 790–804.
- Spagnolo, M., Clark, C.D., Hughes, A.L.C., 2012. Drumlin relief. Geomorphology 153– 154, 179–191.
- Stokes, C.R., Clark, C.D., 1999. Geomorphological criteria for identifying Pleistocene ice streams. Annals of Glaciology 28, 67–74.
- Stokes, C.R., Clark, C.D., 2002. Are long subglacial bedforms indicative of fast ice flow? Boreas 31, 239–249.
- Stokes, C.R., Clark, C.D., 2003a. Giant glacial grooves detected on Landsat ETM+ satellite imagery. International Journal of Remote Sensing 24 (5), 905–910.
- Stokes, C.R., Clark, C.D., 2003b. The Dubawnt Lake palaeo-ice stream: evidence for dynamic ice sheet behaviour on the Canadian Shield and insights regarding the controls on ice stream location and vigour. Boreas 32, 263–279.
- Stokes, C.R., Clark, C.D., 2003c. Laurentide ice streaming on the Canadian Shield: a conflict with the soft-bedded ice stream paradigm? Geology 31 (4), 347–350.
- Stokes, C.R., Clark, C.D., 2004. Evolution of late glacial ice-marginal lakes on the northwestern Canadian Shield and their influence on the location of the Dubawnt Lake palaeo-ice stream. Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology 215, 155–171.
- Stokes, C.R., Clark, C.D., Lian, O., Tulaczyk, S., 2006. Geomorphological map of ribbed moraine on the Dubawnt Lake Ice Stream bed: a signature of ice stream shutdown? Journal of Maps 2006, 1–9.
- Stokes, C.R., Clark, C.D., Lian, O., Tulaczyk, S., 2007. Ice stream sticky spots: a review of their identification and influence beneath contemporary and palaeo-ice streams. Earth-Science Reviews 81, 217–249.
- Stokes, C.R., Lian, O.B., Tulaczyk, S., Clark, C.D., 2008. Superimposition of ribbed moraines on a palaeo-ice stream bed: implications for ice stream dynamics and shut-down. Earth Surface Processes and Landforms 33 (4), 593–609.
- Stokes, C.R., Spagnolo, M., Clark, C.D., 2011. The composition and internal structure of drumlins: complexity, commonality, and implications for a unifying theory of their formation. Earth-Science Reviews 107, 398–422.
- Stokes, C.R., Fowler, A.C., Clark, C.D., Hindmarsh, R.C.A., Spagnolo, M., 2013. The instability theory of drumlin formation and its explanation of their varied composition and internal structure. Quaternary Science Reviews 62, 77–96.
- Thorsteinsson, T., Raymond, C.F., 2000. Sliding versus till deformation in the fast motion of an ice stream over a viscous till. Journal of Glaciology 46 (155), 633–640.
- Tulaczyk, S.M., Scherer, R.P., Clark, C.D., 2001. A ploughing model for the origin of weak tills beneath ice streams: a qualitative treatment. Quaternary International 86 (1), 59–70.
- Tyrrell, J.B., 1906. Report on the Dubawnt, Ferguson, and Kazan Rivers. In: Geological Survey of Canada Annual Report, vol. 9.
- Wellner, J.S., Heroy, D.C., Anderson, J.B., 2006. The death mask of the Antarctic ice sheet: comparison of glacial geomorphic features across the continental shelf. Geomorphology 75, 157–171.